

"ALL TALENTS COUNT"

A PILOT INVENTORY OF NATIONAL CULTURAL POLICIES AND MEASURES SUPPORTING CULTURAL DIVERSITY

PRESENTED TO
THE INCP WORKING GROUP ON CULTURAL DIVERSITY AND GLOBALISATION
BONN, GERMANY - JULY 2001

ERICARTS

Dahlmannstr. 26, D - 53113 Bonn
Tel. (+49-228) 2420996/7 * Fax 241318
e-mail: info@ericarts.org

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Report Resulting from the Pilot Project "All Talents Count"

I.	Introduction.....	3
II.	Presentation of countries participating in the pilot study including:.....	4
	• Population and language groups	
	• Culture and media landscape	
	• Official cultural policy frameworks	
	• Approach to culture diversity in policy making	
	• Key cultural policy instruments to address diversity	
III.	Issue driven presentation of information in the country reports organised.....	9
	according to the WG baskets (emphasis on policy tools and ongoing debates in the different countries participating in the pilot project)	
	Basket 1: Building Human Security and Civil Participation.....	9
	1.1 Human rights	
	1.2 Language policies and services	
	1.3 Approaches to immigration and consideration for policy making	
	1.4 Cultural education and citizenship education	
	Basket 2: Strengthen Diverse Cultural Expression.....	19
	2.1 Public measures and programmes recognising diverse cultural and artistic ex- pression	
	Basket 3: Promoting Diversity in a Global Economy.....	24
	3.1 "Diversity-competition" practices in globalising markets	
	3.2 Direct support measures for domestic content development and production	
	3.3 Indirect measures to stimulate production and distribution	
	3.4 Public support for the promotion of domestic traditions, goods and services	
IV.	Observations and preliminary conclusions.....	32
	"All Talents Count" - Questionnaire.....	36

I. Introduction

In February 2001, the ERICarts Secretariat was asked by the INCP - Working Group on Cultural Diversity and Globalisation to prepare a pilot inventory of national cultural policy objectives, programmes, legislation, strategies and tools that support cultural diversity. The goal was to build an understanding of what the member countries of the Working Group consider to be key domestic policy tools that foster cultural diversity by first taking stock of those national measures already in place. International debates (e.g. on trade agreements or copyright) or regional or local governmental initiatives were not included in this particular exercise

5 countries participated in this pilot phase including: Canada, Hungary, Senegal, South Africa and Sweden. While the original intention was to publish the national responses produced by each of these countries, together with an overview of common and diverging trends, the decision was taken at the Leysin meeting in May 2001 that an integrated report should be prepared and organised within the framework of its "Cultural Diversity Construct". The Working Group developed this Construct as a common tool for identifying different approaches to cultural diversity among its member countries. It is comprised of the following four thematic *baskets*:

- Building Human Security and Civil Participation
- Strengthening Diverse Cultural Expression
- Promoting Diversity and Prosperity in a Global Economy
- Addressing Particular Needs of the Developing World

The questionnaire which is annexed to this report is based on many (not all) of the issues listed in the Working Group's "four baskets"; some terms have been modified to address several cultural contexts. Experts were asked to respond to the questionnaire as independent observers and to present different points of view. The country reports are therefore not official government documents, even if there was fruitful co-operation with government officials.

The information which is presented in this report is the result of co-operation carried out among teams of experts in the different countries and is based on their responses to the questionnaire. ERICarts is indebted to their commitment to the project (which took place under a strict timeframe).

Canada: Greg Baeker (lead) ACP (Arts and Cultural Planning), John Foote, Sharon Jeannotte and Marilyn Smith, Department of Canadian Heritage

Hungary: Peter Inkei, Regional Observatory on Financing Culture in East-Central Europe

Senegal: Moustapha Tambadou, Ministry of Culture, Tourism and Recreation

South Africa: Gerard Hagg (lead), Arlene Grossberg, Mandla Seleokane, Marie Wentzel (Human Sciences Research Council) in co-operation with Carol Steinberg, Jane Duncan, Pieter Conradie

Sweden: Per Svenson (lead) with Gudrun Valquist (National Council for Cultural Affairs)

The editors of this report consider the results of this exercise to be a first step in a longer term process. It does not yet provide a comprehensive picture of how national governments around the world translate the highly complex concept of culture diversity into cultural policy making instruments and practices. Further clarification of key terms and the inclusion of additional countries, from different social, political, economic and cultural contexts and continents would inform and advance the project. In this respect, the country experts which participated in this pilot phase are invited to provide comments, clarify any misunderstandings which naturally result from such a study and contribute additional examples or cases as part of this ongoing process.

II. Introducing the countries participating in the pilot phase

Below is an overview of the countries participating in the pilot phase. Each of the profiles cover essential background information required to contextualise the programmes and policies under discussion in the second half of the paper and which relate to the Working Group's baskets or indicators for cultural diversity in cultural policy making. These thumbnail sketches are not exhaustive.

CANADA

Population: Canada's population is comprised of three founding peoples -- English- and French-speaking, and Aboriginal Peoples -- and is projected in 2001 to reach approximately 31 million. An increasingly diverse Canadian population is reflected in more than 100 ethnic groups: in the 1996 census, 42% reported their ethnic origins as other than British Isles, Canadian, French, or Aboriginal. In 1996 Aboriginal peoples (defined as North American Indian, Métis, or Inuit) in Canada numbered almost 800,000 and represented about 3% of the population, while almost 1.1 million reported Aboriginal origins. Immigrants (including those who have lived in Canada for a number of years as well as more recent arrivals) represent about 15% of the population. Each year ca. 200,000 immigrants arrive in Canada; most settle in larger urban centres. Immigration has out-paced the natural birth rate, accounting for 53% of the overall population growth. The visible minority population is expected to grow in the next twenty years. By 2006, almost one in six persons living in Canada are anticipated to be members of a visible minority. The largest increases of all ethnic groups are projected to be in the Chinese and South Asian groups which will grow from 2.5% and 1.8% respectively in 1991 to 4.3% and 2.9% of the total population in 2006.

Languages: The official languages in Canada are English and French. They are the languages used by the courts, the government, the education system and the media. As a direct result of immigration, there are over 100 world languages spoken in Canada. The most widely used non-official minority languages are: Chinese, Italian, German, Spanish, Portuguese and Punjabi. Minority languages and cultures are often explicitly referred to in government literature and legislation e.g. the *Canadian Multiculturalism Act 1988*. Programmes are designed to assist these and other linguistic groups to integrate into Anglophone and Francophone communities rather than focus on mother-tongue training and development. There are also programmes to support the revitalisation of Aboriginal languages.

Cultural and media infrastructure: One of the biggest challenges to Canada's cultural and media infrastructure is its proximity to the United States. For decades, there have been efforts to minimise US domination over production and distribution in fields such as film and publishing. The strategy has been three-fold: to find a place for domestic content in this environment, to promote Canadian products and productions abroad and to provide Canadians with a choice of content which includes both domestic and foreign cultural goods and services. Ownership of the culture industries in Canada (e.g. sound recording, film and video, publishing and TV and radio broadcasting) is increasingly concentrated in the hands of relatively few corporations which control much of the process of cultural production and distribution.

Official cultural policy framework: Canada does not have a *single* cultural policy framework but has a series of policies, programs and other instruments which together form a framework for discussion and analysis. Official cultural policy reviews have been undertaken since the 1950s. The latest conducted by the Standing Committee on Culture in 1999, noted the impacts of the rapid pace of demographic change, new technologies and globalisation of economics and trade on cultural production. In this context, some of the Department of Canadian Heritage priorities include: raising domestic share in the cultural industries, supporting the development of Canadian content in both official languages, promoting social cohesion by reducing social exclusion and ensuring access to culture. A well-established network of professional artists associations, organised according to different sectors and disciplines, have all participated in the policy reviews over the years.

Approach to culture diversity in policy making: Cultural diversity in policy making in Canada is a highly complex and controversial process. It has evolved from an early assimilationist model with goals directed toward nation building and constructing a modern Canadian identity which emphasized the dominant cultural heritage of English and French speaking Canadians - to one that embraces diversity as a fundamental characteristic of Canadian life. Canadian policies seek to strike a balance between those that promote shared Canadian values while removing discriminatory barriers to employment, service delivery and civic participation. Today, cultural diversity discussions are often held under the rubric of social cohesion and global trade.

Key cultural policy instruments to address diversity: Policies directed toward addressing diverse or multiple forms of expression often reflect the natural tension between approaches emphasizing reforming the 'mainstream' and strategies providing support for groups outside the mainstream. Key policy instruments that recognise the multicultural character of Canada include: the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, 1982* and the *Canadian Multiculturalism Act, 1988, the Immigration Act and the Broadcasting Act and Regulations.*

HUNGARY

Population: There are ca. 10 million people living in Hungary (2001). There is 1 ethnic minority group (the Roma people) and 12 recognised national minority groups (Armenians, Bulgarians, Croatians, Germans, Greeks, Poles, Romanians, Ruthenians, Serbians, Slovaks, Slovenians and Ukrainians). Immigrants are ca. 1% of the population.

Languages: The official language of Hungary is Hungarian. There are 14 recognised minority languages including those of the 12 national minority groups and two Roma languages: Romani and Beash. Language minorities have a wide range of public services provided to them including mother-tongue education and a number of television and radio programmes broadcast weekly. The government's efforts in the field of language policy and training are to "slow down the linguistic assimilation of minorities".

Culture and media infrastructure: Since the 1960s, Hungary has been slowly dismantling its ideological constraints and adapting its culture to market conditions. Today, the culture infrastructure is similar to Western Europe both physically (theatres, television stations, cable TV) and in content (programming). High degrees of civic pride in national culture and achievements keep a system of folklore based products (peasant dance, fiddle music, wedding rock etc) alive in cultural centres or in dance houses (táncház). Some of the early fears of foreign domination have recently subsided as multinationals such as Bertelsmann (book publishing) have failed and withdrew their businesses from Hungary (today 25% of market share for books is foreign owned). On the other hand, the audiovisual landscape (TV, film and video) is flooded with foreign content: Hungarian films are difficult to find on the programme of several newly built cinema centres. In the latter case, the government is stepping in as *producers* of films or *owners* of cinemas to help stimulate the sector.

Official cultural policy framework: Hungarian cultural policy is based on an oral tradition, without a basic framework or high level official documents to guide policy makers in their decision making. Political winds have had a large role in determining the government's culture policy priorities. Current government priorities include preservation of cultural heritage, integration of the protection of monuments into cultural policy, promoting the culture of Hungarians living abroad and emphasizing the role of the Church. As in other post-communist countries, artists association have gone through a deep legitimization crisis. Some, such as the filmmakers association, are quite active in searching for new solutions rather than maintaining their old status quo.

Approach to culture diversity in policy making: From 1994-98, the liberal party placed multiculturalism high on the agenda with emphasis on a wide range of minority groups (not just ethnic minorities). Today, the politics has placed emphasis on the other side of the "diversity" coin: to protect and promote national heritage as a means to defend the nation against the effects of globalisa-

tion. This has meant renewed attention to cultural institutions and more involvement of the Ministry in major projects, direct subsidies, investment and production.

Key cultural policy instruments to address diversity: Measures are conceived as investments in local (national) production to provide a "diversity balance" against foreign products. For example, special levies on foreign films to reinvest in contemporary Hungarian films. International festivals are the main vehicle to provide alternative content to Hungarian or global culture productions. Government support is provided for festivals promoting both traditional art forms (opera) and new art forms (alternative film and multimedia). Otherwise, the Ministry has no major programmes or quota systems to regulate the involvement of minorities in cultural life.

SENEGAL

Population: At the beginning of 2001, ca. 9 million people were reported to be living in Senegal. This population is comprised of some 20 ethnic groups, the main six including: Wolof, Serer, Pular, Mandinka, Soninke and Jola. These groups are scattered throughout the country with strong concentrations in certain territorial areas. Immigrants are ca. 6% of the population.

Languages: The official language of Senegal is French and there are 7 other officially recognised languages (which are considered "national" languages -- not necessarily official "minority" languages -- but do not have the same status as French). While French is the *lingua franca* of official communication to the public, of education and of media programming, there have been several NGO initiatives in recent years to promote the use of the "other" native languages through literacy programmes and experimental classes. Without these initiatives there would be no education or training for ethnic or language minorities in their mother-tongue.

Culture and media infrastructure: There is a relatively traditional, European or Western influenced infrastructure for culture and media in Senegal:

- national art school
- museums, a national gallery, private galleries,
- national theatre and concert hall
- public television network (+regional production units), community and private radio stations
- biennale of visual arts, international book fair, international fashion week,
- performances in cyber and theatre cafés (There are 60,000 Internet users in Senegal, over 50% located in Dakar. Only 5% of the rural villages have a telephone connection).

Most of the modern culture industries are:

- located in the capital Dakar (the Francophonie has recently stepped in and set up two "test" regional cultural centres to give residents outside the capital access to books);
- produced in French language; (some tabloids are available in Wolof or Pulaar languages)
- both vertically and horizontally concentrated in few, mostly foreign, hands (for example: the major publishing company - Nouvelle Éditions Africaines du Sénégal - is a subsidiary of Havas Diffusion Int. or XIPPI company owned by Y. N'Dour which owns everything from a night club to a radio station, press, sound recording production company, a studio etc).

Official cultural policy framework: The "Lettre de Politique de Développement du Secteur de la Culture" is the official government statement on cultural policy which outlines governmental priorities including: investment in infrastructure, international co-operation, basic supply of services from the State, access to information and promoting private-third sector initiatives. Since the adoption of this "Lettre" professional artists associations have been able to consult the government on the formulation of its cultural policy. Until this time, the State had ultimate control via the former Ministry for Culture and Communication (now separate ministries).

Approach to culture diversity in policy making: Cultural diversity policies are more about relinquishing State control over cultural production than to the promotion of any particular national or ethnic minority group in the country. Given the lack of infrastructure to produce and distribute nationally or locally created content, there is little assurance that a diversity of content will emerge in the face of imports of French language and other foreign cultural goods/services.

Key cultural policy instruments to address diversity: There are hardly any government programmes or measures to support the development of local production and distribution; in cases where there are initiatives, they are grossly under-resourced. Recent policies remain in the theoretical development stage and are accused of being ill-defined. Resources are being sought from the private sector and international organisations such as the World Bank for such purposes.

SOUTH AFRICA

Population: According to the 1996 census, there are ca. 40.58 million people living in South Africa. Based on historical political developments, the population used to be - and often still is -- divided into 4 groups: Black/African (76,7%), White (10,9%), Coloured (8,9%) and Asian (2,6%). In addition there are over 4 million immigrants, mostly coming from other African countries which equals ca. 10% of the total population.

Languages: The 11 official languages of South Africa are: Afrikaans, English, IsiNdebele, IsiXhosa, IsiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, SiSwati, Tshivenda and Xitsonga. The most widely spoken or dominant of these languages are Afrikaans, Xhosa, Zulu and Sesotho (in that order). The officially recognised minority languages are the Khoe-San languages (representing 1% of the population). There is an increasing use of English throughout the public service, in schools and in media programming.

Culture and media infrastructure: The result of the apartheid era was the development of a culture and media infrastructure, services and market economy for culture that exclusively served the needs of the White community including museums, theatres, galleries, arts education etc. Public media targeted at Black people ensured their subservient position. Today, policies are designed to shift this imbalance, including a decline in State subsidies which had supported this infrastructure and the break-up of large-scale culture institutions into independent, non-profit companies. Change is slow. Individual projects and initiatives in the field of popular culture (music in particular) which were successful, despite the apartheid era, are the areas of strongest growth.

Due to relaxed import regulations, the market is flooded with products from around the world which can often be sold at lower prices than indigenous goods (including crafts). Foreign ownership of the media is dominant and global companies such as Time Warner and America Online (now one company) use local media companies as outlets for their own goods and services. The press are monopolised by a few companies with strong foreign shareholders, although the biggest daily, the Sowetan, is owned by a Black empowerment group. English is the dominant language of newspapers. Local companies struggle to compete to retain a significant share of their own market. National and regional festivals as well as tourism destinations are the main outlets for indigenous cultural production.

Official cultural policy framework: During apartheid, policies for the arts and culture were managed under several different departments of Education for different groups of the population. Today, a more comprehensive national cultural policy framework has been developed through three different mechanisms: 1994 Reconstruction and Development Programme, the 1996 Constitution and a 1997 White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage. The main emphasis of the framework is two fold: 1) to balance the need for unity and nation building with demands for cultural rights and 2) relief of poverty, economic empowerment and promotion of creativity through the arts and culture. It is administered via a single Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology and the Council of Culture Ministers. Arts and artists organisations have participated in building the government's new policy via national and regional arts forums and task groups. There are, however, no official procedures to sustain their input.

Approach to culture diversity in policy making: The arts and culture -- in the larger sense -- are being used to promote social capital, economic empowerment of the poor, and to develop people's identity. Culture diversity is therefore being developed to bring about "social cohesion" or more specifically, to facilitate the redistribution of resources which were previously directed to the White community. It is clearly an important element of the government's "rainbow nation" policy. An

independent commission on cultural diversity situated within the Presidency has been proposed, yet is experiencing difficulty in determining the main groups to be represented on the commission.

Key cultural policy instruments to address diversity: In its effort to redistribute resources, the government has set up specialised grant and funding schemes which emphasise poor communities from different "groups" and has adopted affirmative action programmes in culture institutions.

SWEDEN

Population: The most recent figures for Sweden (1998) indicate a population of 8.8 million. There are five national minorities which have been acknowledged including: Jews, Romi, Sami, Swedish Finns and Torne-valley Finns; the majority of which are concentrated in very specific areas of Sweden. A 1998 survey indicates that 30% of all immigrants in Sweden come from the Nordic countries - the remaining 60% coming generally from the former Yugoslavia, from the Middle East, South America and Europe. Together they add up to approximately 1 million people or 11% of the population.

Languages: The official language of Sweden is Swedish. The officially recognised minority languages are: Sami (all forms), Finnish, Meänkieli (Torne valley Finnish), Romani Chib (all forms) and Jiddish. Great care is taken by the State to preserve and promote the Swedish language as a "minority world language" through reading programmes targeted at children, substantial support to literature and libraries etc. While there is a legal right for minorities to receive public information in their native language, there are not enough resources to ensure the implementation of this right. The majority of media programming is in Swedish with some specialised programmes in other languages.

Culture and media infrastructure: One of the most notable characteristics of the culture and media landscape in Sweden is the high degree to which the State maintains responsibility. This basic premise of Swedish cultural policy has also protected local production and distribution. It was not until recently that the landscape has started to change - ever slightly -- and new actors have begun to appear thanks to 90's deregulation. Due to its small language area, large multinational media conglomerates have not necessarily been able to dominate the Swedish market as in other countries. Instead, global companies are concentrating in one or another sector (mainly film or music) to attract the attention of the Swedish public. Their growth potential is estimated to be limited.

Official cultural policy framework: National cultural policy in Sweden remains rooted in 1974 goals decided upon by the Parliament. The overall aims taken by the government in the field of culture and the media range from safeguarding freedom of expression to increasing participation in cultural life and ensuring content diversity to "counteract the negative effects of commercialisation". The range of government support for artists is considered to be one of the most extensive in the world. Artists and their association play a key role in shaping cultural policy.

Approach to culture diversity in policy making: The Swedish approach to culture diversity lies in one of its fundamental culture policy principles of counteracting commercialisation. The government's policies are aimed at strengthening artistic diversity and media pluralism within Swedish borders through an extensive system of support to creative life (both creation and participation of citizens in cultural life) and emphasis on community development and local cultural life.

Key cultural policy instruments to address diversity: There are a few funding schemes developed for national minorities, the most concentrated in the field of literature and periodicals with cultural content. Separate programmes and institutions are set up for the indigenous Sami people.

III. Overview of Policy Measures and Programmes Presented in the Country Reports

Basket 1: Building Human Security and Civic Participation

1.1 Human rights legislation and infrastructure

According to the country studies, basic principles of human rights are legally enshrined in three ways:

- via the Constitution of federal/national governments through specific articles, acts or charters;
- treated separately in legislation dealing with various groups including the rights of the child, of women, employment, immigration, indigenous peoples, *inter alia* and;
- in case law.

Despite the universality of human rights declarations and requirements, implementation is not necessarily guaranteed or extended into specific policy domains including cultural policy. According to the report from South Africa, the constitutional requirements for human rights have led to the establishment of the South African Human Rights Commission, but its impact on cultural diversity is limited. In other countries, it has been difficult to determine whether human rights commitments have been sufficiently realised as few indicators have been implemented to assess the effectiveness and reach of human rights legislation or similar national policy objectives.

There are various conceptual starting points to developing a human rights framework ranging from individual to collective or group rights (Senegal) or both (Canada, Sweden, South Africa):

- in Hungary, human rights is primarily based on individual rights and on a separate system of collective rights for cultural and linguistic minorities within the country.

The Canadian report for this study identifies the tension between civil liberties (individual rights - everyone is treated the same) and human rights (collective or group rights whereby people are treated equitably according to their differences). Such approaches are at the core of many debates related to diversity and may be construed as 1) constructive to assert the rights of specific groups as well as 2) less significant because they do not directly address the fundamental issues at the heart of discrimination: political, social and economic power imbalances.

- in South Africa, human rights are both individual and group based. The Preamble to the Constitution starts with a reference to the injustices of the past and the need to heal divisions, and to unity in diversity. The past was based on group rights and injustices, not individual ones. Language (as a group right) is an important part of the Founding Provisions of the Constitution. Chapter 2, the Bill of Rights, is based on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and focuses throughout on individual rights. However, par. 31 refers to cultural, religious and linguistic communities, and the freedom of individuals to belong to and enjoy cultural practices. The need to cover both individual and group rights is confirmed by the strong emphasis on belonging to a community, which is typical African, but is reinforced by competition for scarce resources and the use of groups to protect their individual interests. Another area where groups are important is in labour with its affirmative action/employment equity laws that are based on group (black empowerment). What is important is that eventually groups are based on self-identification, not government classification.

Recourse of the public to a legal system (e.g. from a constitutional court to local police stations or human rights offices) is an essential part of the democratic process upon which human rights legislation can function. One means employed by different countries has been the establishment of formal infrastructure such as human rights commissions, tribunals and departmental programmes, "ombuds-persons" whose purposes vary from:

- central guardians of human rights in general and of minorities in particular
- mediators which accept grievances or reports about violations against human rights including discrimination by State or local administrations
- enforcing legislation to protect and promote minority rights
- acting as a compensation for the lack of legislative tools or strategies. For example, human rights offices and the Mediator of the Republic of Senegal have been set up in part because Senegalese law does not provide for individual recourse to a constitutional judge.

NGO's and grass roots organisations also play a significant role in some countries by: (these organisations do not necessarily have a "culture" dimension or interest)

- providing legal advice (NEKI – Legal Defence Bureau's for National and Ethnic Minorities, Hungary)
- acting as independent watchdogs of government activities (e.g. the Rencontre Africaine des Droits de l'Homme which supervises government elections)
- working in partnership with government departments to monitor the general human rights situation throughout the country (the Department of Canadian Heritage is responsible for the collection of data and preparation of reports for international organisations on Canadian progress with respect to human rights.)

1.1.2 Public discussion on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights

The "Universal Declaration of Human Rights" has rarely appeared in public debates in recent years. While general acknowledgement is made of the various principles making up the UDHR, countries have adopted their own approaches to developing human rights policies and frameworks.

In some cases, countries have come under criticism from the United Nations and its agencies: in the past 5 years, Sweden has been "condemned by the UN Committee on torture for the rejection of persons seeking asylum and at the risk of being exposed to torture in their native countries".

1.1.3 Articles of human rights within the framework of cultural policy making

The UDHR recognised the right to participate in cultural life as a fundamental human right in 1948, however, the principle of cultural rights can be considered its most under-utilised -- and some would argue -- underdeveloped article to date.

There have been few specific legislative attempts by national governments to bring articles of human rights into cultural policies. On the other hand, there are several basic principles of human rights which are at the core of cultural policy development. These principles can address:

- minority groups (e.g. freedom to express oneself according to linguistic and cultural identity, the right to nationality and the right to change nationality)
- audiences (e.g. right to participate in and have access to the cultural life of their community, freedom of choice)
- artists/creators (e.g. freedoms of expression, to create, to have access to means to disseminate or distribute their works and ideas)
- society as a whole (e.g. the obligation to respect and protect cultures via mutual tolerance and co-operation)

Out of the countries surveyed in this pilot project, only Senegal and South Africa claim to have direct references to human rights in cultural policy. In South Africa, for example, the *1996 White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage* refers to the Bill of Rights and the UDHR as its basis and its *1996 Films and Publications Act* is founded on freedom of expression, freedom of religion, the protection of children from potentially harmful and disturbing materials, the protection of dignity and privacy and the principles of natural justice.

Cultural policy and human rights in Hungary, Canada and Sweden are still treated as fairly separate domains, yet one can find evidence of policies and programmes whose aims support some of the principles listed above such as promoting mutual tolerance between cultures or the right to participate fully in cultural life (Sweden).

Most countries have specific clauses in media related legislation which secure a basic level of freedom of expression and extend this security to publication, access to information and privacy protection as well as protection of sources:

- Senegal: the Constitution specifically guarantees freedom of the press and press organisations and also outlines their obligations to society and the means of government control available. Journalists in Senegal are, however, demanding that the *Press Act* be revised to provide free access to information sources, even when they are under the "seal of confidentiality". A new report has been released on the institutional framework and economic environment of the press, the status of journalists and communication professionals, regulatory and self-regulatory bodies and the relations between the press and public authorities.
- South Africa: the *Bill of Rights* in the Constitution protects freedom of expression, and the *Open Democracy Act* (which is expected in the near future) should ensure access to information from the public sphere to all people and allow the media to maintain a critical stance. Articles of the *Criminal Prosecution Act* are being criticised for not providing sufficient protection for reporters and editors.

1.2 Language Policies and Services

1.2.1 Official languages, policies and provision of services

Language policies are entrenched in historical political developments and are today confronted by challenges posed by, for example, new immigration patterns. The Hungarian, Senegalese, South African and Swedish governments have legally recognised the mother-tongue languages of specified groups of minorities living within their borders; lately acknowledged as a factor of social or cultural cohesion. The Constitutions of these countries usually spell out the official languages and have provisions which grant national and ethnic minorities certain rights. For example, according to the South African Constitution, everyone has the right to use the language of his or her choice and has the right to receive instruction in the language of his or her choice, where this is reasonably possible.

The right to receive public services in one's own mother tongue is also a common practise which can range from receiving government documents in one's own mother-tongue, to having access to translators/interpreters for legal transactions to everyday communication in the public sphere (e.g. shop signs, street signs etc). Such rights are, however, not always translated into practice. The Swedish report, for example, indicates that minorities do not generally have access to official government documentation in their mother-tongue language. While officially there is a right to access such documentation in their mother-tongue language, "translation difficulties and lack of resources pose the greatest challenge".

The country reports outlined **challenges for policy and programme makers** which include:

- Citizens are often not sufficiently aware or do not use opportunities made available by existing language laws or policies. In Hungary, for example, it is very difficult to find citizens who avail themselves of the opportunities offered by language laws; the number of communities which possess a distinct live culture and use their (minority) language for daily communication is very small. Religious cohesion is far more significant. The South African Constitution states that national and provincial governments may use any official language, but at least two, taking into account usage, practicality and expense. However, there is a marked move towards unilingualism (mainly English) in the public sector and in official publications.
- Official language policies do not necessarily reflect the changing make up of the population: For example, 30% of all immigrants in Sweden come from the Nordic countries - the remaining 60% coming generally from the former Yugoslavia, from the Middle East, South America and Europe. The official languages, also used in schools, are Swedish, Finnish, Sami, Torne valley-Finnish and Yiddish (Nordic language groups). In Canada, more than 60% of all immigrants since the mid 90s have come from Asia alone – especially Hong Kong, India, the People’s Republic of China, Taiwan, the Philippines, Pakistan and Sri Lanka. Canada’s language policies currently do not officially recognise language groups other than English and French (and more recently some Aboriginal languages) although a number of federal government agencies do offer services in many more languages. In larger urban centres, government documents are increasingly available in minority languages congruent with the population.
- There are legal preconditions to being recognised as a national minority language. In Hungary, the law specifies a precondition of at least one hundred years co-existence with the majority nation before it is accepted as an official ethnic and linguistic minority. This article excludes "modern" or "new" immigrant groups from obtaining language rights.
- Immigration patterns are increasing the daily or home use of languages not recognised as official or national minority languages. For example in Sweden, it is estimated that more than 140 languages are spoken in different family homes due to recent immigration. There are an estimated 100 different ethnic groups living in Canada, who collectively speak over 100 of the world’s estimated 5,000 living languages.
- Linguistic communities founded on the border regions of their native countries form their own cultural and linguistic communities. In Senegal, it has been reported that immigrants found mainly in the regions bordering their native countries are easier to integrate linguistically and often share cultural values. For example, the Bambara of Mali are close to Mandinka and Pulaar is spoken both in Guinea and in upper Casamance (Kolda region).
- Due to urbanisation and migration over the past hundred years most languages are spoken in cities far away from their roots. (e.g. in South Africa, most urbanites now speak English).
- Low literary rates effect the use of official languages. In this case, minority communities tend to maintain their mother-tongue. (e.g. in rural areas of South Africa, literacy levels are low and people mainly speak their mother-tongue. This creates disadvantage with regard to access to the labour and economic markets where English and Afrikaan languages dominate.)

Measures have been developed in the different countries to respond to some of these challenges:

- *Government programmes to address the diminishing use of indigenous languages.* For example, the South African government has recently acknowledged the Khoe San language - spoken by the oldest known population group in the country - by establishing the National Khoe-San Council which is responsible for the promotion of these languages and dialects. Similar efforts are underway in Canada through the federal Aboriginal Language Program to support the revitalisation and maintenance of Aboriginal languages, however, the resources devoted to the programme remain small even in areas of the North where Aboriginal people form a majority of the population.
- *Regional initiatives which provide support to specific projects.* The Pan South African Language Board (PANSALB) acts as a watchdog to address the language needs of all South Africans. Through its national and provincial offices, it promotes functional multilingualism by supporting and funding projects promoting languages, studies and research. It has established National Lexicographic Units for all languages.
- *Translating and recording language cultures:* Dictionaries in English-to-other-languages are available for most languages in South Africa. Two Bills that aim to promote the equitable use of official languages and developing previously marginalised languages are the 2000 *Language Policy Draft Bill* and the 2000 *Translation and Interpreting Professions Council Draft Bill*.
- *Integrationist approach:* Programmes in Canada are designed to assist diverse linguistic groups in acquiring the language skills necessary to integrate into Anglophone and Francophone communities for purposes such as overcoming barriers to entering the labour force.

1.2.2 Formal and informal language education and training

Table 1: Mother-tongue education for minority groups

	Basic rights to mother tongue education for minority groups	Separate courses taught in mother tongue in the public school system		
		Primary School	High School	University
Canada (a)	X	X	X	X
Hungary	X	X	--	X (b)
Senegal	--	(c)	--	--
South Africa	X	X (d)	--	X (e)
Sweden	X	X (f)	--	--

Notes:

- a) English and French as a second language (ESL/FSL) programmes are offered to immigrants to strengthen their language skills needed for the labour market. Such courses are also available at the university level.
- b) Limited to teacher training.
- c) In certain schools there are experimental classes offering instruction in national minority languages.
- d) Only the first four years, after which courses are offered in English.
- e) In English and Afrikaans.
- f) Only for the first seven years. Yiddish is not taught in the national public education system but in private schools.

Most of the countries surveyed provide mother tongue teaching at the primary school level. There are, however, conditions placed upon this right including significant numbers of pupils and availability of qualified teachers. Such teaching normally takes place outside of normal school hours. In Canada and South Africa, government support is provided to those wishing to continue with their

training and take exams in their mother tongue language. As education and educational policy is the jurisdiction of regional or provincial governments in most countries, decision-making about mother tongue language programmes is left up to the individual school boards which must also cover the extra costs for such "extracurricular activities", as separate school subjects.

The aim of most education policies is to train immigrants and official minority groups in either the official language of the country or in English as a *lingua franca* of some labour markets. Language learning and co-operation is generally used as a means to foster social cohesion:

- *within the whole of society*: (e.g. in South Africa many schools offer *double-medium* education to accommodate White and Black pupils, an approach that is suppose to contribute to mutual respect and reconciliation. Canada offers English and French as a second language programmes (ESL/FSL) to immigrants to strengthen their language skills needed for the labour market).
- *within specific groups or communities*: (e.g. in Canada, one of the aims of the Aboriginal Languages Programme is to increase the number and quality of Aboriginal language projects within Aboriginal communities)
- *within language borders* . (e.g. the neighbouring "mother-countries" of Hungary have been offering study grants for young people in their native languages)

1.2.3 Provision of programmes and services in mother-tongue languages of officially recognised linguistic minorities by national or publicly funded media organisations

Table 2: Provision of media programmes in minority languages (radio, TV, press)

	Radio	Print	Television
Canada	(a)	X (b)	(c)
Hungary	X	X	X
Senegal	X	-	X
South Africa	X	-	X (d)
Sweden	X	-	X

Notes:

- a) Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (CBC) provides *radio* programmes in English, French and 8 Aboriginal languages. Broadcasting licenses for language specific radio stations have been granted.
- b) The Publications Assistance Programme of the Department of Canadian Heritage supports a number of ethnic community and minority language weekly newspapers.
- c) Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (CBC) provides *television* programmes in English, French and 8 Aboriginal languages. Broadcasting licenses for language specific television stations have been granted to both the public and private sector as well as specialty channels available over digital cable and satellite.
- d) The South African Broadcasting Company broadcast television programmes in all official languages, but not equally. English is the dominant language.

Linguistic diversity in publicly funded media organisations requires additional attention. Despite clearly stated legislative and policy goals aimed at preserving or developing minority languages as an important component of diversity, such national organisations provide few regular programming or services in languages other than official ones. There are some examples of good practice which can be found in:

- *Sweden* where new measures are being developed to promote dissemination of public radio and TV programmes in various immigrant languages;
- *South Africa* where the free-to-air TV broadcasts by the national South African Broadcasting Company (SABC) and the e.tv are providing programmes in national minority languages such as the Nguni and Sotho language groups, as well as English and Afrikaans;

- *Hungary* where the public television broadcasts regular programmes in 7 minority languages (ca. 800 minutes per month) and there are public radio programmes in 13 languages (over 600 minutes per day!)

Most innovation for programming in minority languages comes from third sector actors and local communities. For example, in Hungary, the Public Foundation for Minorities subsidises 17 periodicals in 13 minority languages, gives grants to local television stations for programmes in minority languages and bears almost all of the costs for publishing books in minority languages. Their budget is equivalent to the entire cultural spending of local governments in Hungary (or 24% of all public money spent on culture in Hungary in 2000). Of all the South African media, community radio stations are by far the most successful in offering information to people in their mother tongue. A few newspapers exist of which *Ilanga* in KwaZulu-Natal has the largest readership. *Bona*, a magazine in English, Nguni and Sotho languages, has a circulation of 177, 905.

Local communities and private initiatives are eligible for some government grants to produce programmes in non-official minority languages (e.g. in Canada).

In some countries, local initiatives are trying to attract mainstream audiences which on the one hand diversifies the audience for their programming while on the other hand limits its reach to local audiences in demand for programming in their mother tongue. For example, in South Africa, Black community stations tend to broadcast in English.

Public libraries have also been used as a vehicle for disseminating information, mostly newspapers, magazines and books, in immigrant and minority languages. In most cases, such as in Sweden, printed material is imported from abroad and does not empower the readers with news or information about local life of the community or the nation.

1.3 Immigration and considerations for policy making

While the immigration traditions of the countries surveyed differ greatly, all of them have specific policies, with detailed goals and restrictions which regulate immigration patterns and influence the development of ethnically defined communities; the basis of which are linked to economic rather than cultural development. Below is an overview of some common criteria used in selecting who may or may not enter the country.

Table 3: Immigration Criteria

	Local Sponsor (local employer or family)	Sufficient financial resources	Specific skills		Refugees / asylum seekers
			High level skills (e.g. technology training)	Skilled Labourers	
Canada	X	X	X	X	X
Hungary		X			X
Senegal	X		X		X
South Africa	X		X	X	X
Sweden	X	X	X	X	X

In the countries surveyed, there are different types or classifications of immigrants:

- temporary or transitory immigrants: skilled or unskilled labourers, students, refugees planning to return to their native country
- asylum seekers who may become permanent immigrants

- permanent immigrants who eventually obtain citizenship but remain part of an immigrant or ethnic cultural group
- immigrants or their descendants who not only obtain citizenship, but are integrated quickly into the wider sociocultural community and adopt its values

Some of the most difficult and contentious questions which directly impact the development and application of "cultural diversity" as a policy concept are indeed those related to immigration and citizenship (immigrant status does not necessarily presuppose citizenship). Government policies in these fields set the tone in individual countries on attitudes and behaviours towards "others", "foreigners", "minorities", "national unity or pride". Given public reaction to the growth of immigrants in countries around the world, the pitch of this tone is becoming more and more evident. For example:

- The apparent rise in xenophobia in South Africa is blamed on the recent increase of immigration, e.g. blaming immigrants for maintaining high levels of unemployment, contributing to high crime rates and overloading the health and education systems. Anti-immigrant sentiments had led to violence which had had repercussions for local producers and foreigners of all kinds: tourists, refugees, asylum seekers and legitimate foreign workers. The police have not protected them. This example is not only limited to South Africa.
- On the other hand, Canadian attitudes to immigration have historically been mixed. One recent poll indicated that 49% of Canadians disagreed with increasing the number of immigrants each year, with 33% agreeing (Macleans/Global Poll, 2000). Equally significant was the finding that 71% of Canadians agreed that "Canada should insist that immigrants adopt Canadian values", compared to 20% disagreeing. However, another recent survey by EKOS Research (2001) found that supportive attitudes toward immigrants are still tepid but have been gradually increasing in the last seven years – in 1994, 52% believed that "too many" immigrants were coming to Canada while in 2001, this number has dropped to 31%.

Governmental concepts and approaches to immigrants have an impact on the development of policy measures and programmes in the broader understanding of the cultural field which could include education, language, media programming etc. For example, whether different immigrant or ethnocultural groups of artists are identified and supported separately or whether "mainstreaming" measures, affirmative action or quota systems are selected as cultural policy measures and tools to address diversity. Different approaches to immigrants which have an impact on cultural policy making could include:

- *Integration to national cultural life*: Immigrants should fully integrate into the mainstream of society by learning the official languages and are to eventually share nationally defined values and traditions;
- *Preservation of ethnic identities*: Immigrants should NOT fully integrate into the society, but be allocated government support to preserve their "native" languages, customs and traditions;
- *Hybridisation*: Immigrants add certain features to the national value system and culture, are defined as citizens and are given opportunities to participate in civic life;
- *Power sharing*: Social, economic and political power is shared among all groups in society and there is no dominant group. Individual cultures remain identifiable.

In practice most countries adopt policies that reflect a mixture of these perspectives.

1.3.1 Settlement policies for immigrants

Table 4: Provision of settlement programmes or policies

	Settlement Policies	Settlement Programmes	No Settlement Policies or Programmes
Canada (a)	X	X	
Hungary			X
Senegal			X
South Africa			X
Sweden		X	

Notes:

a) Settlement policies are mandated under provincial legislation and realised by the municipalities

There are very few settlement policies or programmes in place to assist immigrants when they arrive in their new country. In many cases, immigrants or refugees are expected to live with and receive support from families or friends. In cases where this is not possible, the State has intervened (Sweden) by providing low quality housing; such efforts have not necessarily helped immigrants to escape ghettos. The exception is in Canada which has a range of settlement programmes administered under individual federal and provincial governments. Some federal programmes include:

- Immigrant Settlement and Adaptation Programme: provides services ranging from reception and orientation, translation-interpretation, counselling etc. They also provide a pre-departure session in selected countries to prepare immigrants for specific aspects of Canadian life such as climate, culture shock, employment, education and cost of living.
- Host Programme: recruits volunteers to host "newcomers" and help them to integrate into Canadian life. The programme was designed as a "two-way street" approach which also benefits resident Canadians
- Language Instruction for Newcomers Programme: a free service provided to all immigrants

1.4 Cultural education as citizenship education

Table 5: Locating cultural education in policy making

	Cultural education part of cultural policies and programmes	Cultural education part of education policies and curricula	Cultural education does not exist as a specific component
Canada	X	(a)	
Hungary		X	
Senegal			X
South Africa		X	
Sweden	X	X	

Notes:

a) Education policies and curricula are within the jurisdiction of the provinces and indeed vary from province to province.

In almost all of the countries surveyed, cultural education (sometimes referred to as citizenship education or misunderstood as arts education) has been integrated as a component of education policies and curricula. The objectives or goals of cultural education have been described as:

- a mechanism to promote shared national values and identity

- a tool to promote specific values such tolerance, multilingualism, equality and accountability (South Africa)
- a means to raise awareness of cultural heritage through the programmes of national cultural institutions such as galleries, archives, libraries or broadcasting organisations (Canada)
- an important factor to enhance the participation of citizens in cultural life (Sweden)

Cultural education has been known to be used as a tool of propaganda (promoting nationalism instead of a diversity of ideas and values) and as a means to reinforce suppression: under the previous South African government, citizen education in schools largely promoted White dominance and enshrined government policy on separate education. As a result the new government was reluctant to initiate similar education in public schools.

1.4.1 Youth exchange programmes to promote dialogue

Table 6: Provision of exchange programmes for youth

	Youth exchange programmes within the country	Youth exchange programmes with cultures from other countries	Both	No government programmes
Canada	X	X	X	
Hungary				X
Senegal	X	X	X	
South Africa				X
Sweden				X

Among the countries surveyed, Canada and Senegal are only two which have government supported youth exchange programmes:

- Youth Exchanges Canada (reciprocal exchanges with youth from different communities within Canada) and Youth Forums Canada (young Canadians are brought together in one Canadian community to discuss issues of national interest)
- In Senegal the government has set up a national and inter-African youth exchange programme. At the national level, a Youth Council has been set up to promote dialogue among youth activists from all political parties. In addition, a Youth and Culture Week is organised every two years which brings together young people from around the country in the fields of sports, culture and arts competitions. On the pan-African level, the Week of Friendship and Fraternity is a biennale of youth coming from Senegal, Mali, Gambia, Guinea Conakry and Guinea-Bissau.

Other initiatives mentioned include:

- Youth study programmes organised in schools (Sweden participates in the EU-ERASMUS programme which facilitates exchange on the university level)
- Programmes for unemployed youth to obtain work experience in another country (Sweden)

Basket 2: Strengthening Diverse Cultural Expression

2.1 Public measures and programmes recognising diverse cultural and artistic expression

When examining cultural diversity in the context of cultural policy making, there is the occasional tendency to focus mainly on groups (ethno racial or language groups) and this exercise was no exception.

We are aware, however, that strengthening cultural and artistic expression can be and has been supported via cultural policy, programme development and direct funding measures for both *groups* as well as for *individual* creativity/talents. In this context, two basic visions of cultural diversity in cultural policy making could be distinguished which support:

- a) a marketplace of diverse ideas, styles, expressions, art forms (incl. hybrid cultural forms) to which as many people as possible have access
- b) culture as a means of cohesion for different linguistic, ethno racial or spiritual groups or for different generations or gender. These groups are recognised and have equal or at least similar access to public funds, the media and other platforms for expression.

Public measures have traditionally provided *direct support* to individual artists via awards, scholarships, project or work grants, loans for start-ups, (re)training opportunities, etc and *indirect support* via the development of specific policies or pieces of legislation (including cultural, tax, employment or social policies etc). These can be considered necessary tools which provide opportunities for artists and media practitioners to overcome obstacles such as:

- market inequalities caused by lack of true competition
- high entry barriers maintained by gatekeepers in the cultural labour market
- extraordinary capital and technology intensive investments
- lack of "consumer" experience with new art forms/hybrid cultural forms
- challenges presented to contemporary artistic production and for emerging artists which can contribute to diversity discourse

An important challenge for cultural policy makers has been whether it is more beneficial to continue providing support for separate groups via programmes and institutions or whether to create conditions which would ensure equal access of all individuals to mainstream funding opportunities and marketplaces:

- a) On the one hand, there has been great resistance to "separate or specialised" approaches which often come from the artists and media professionals themselves as they fear placement in ghettos far away from their intended audiences.
- b) On the other hand, it has been recognised (especially in gender debates) that specialised institutions and networks are important actors and should be supported as part of an integrative process required to achieve goals such as equality.

There have been some recent attempts to implement the concept of "mainstreaming" into cultural policy-making processes¹. In Sweden, for example, a special programme committee has been set up

¹ The concept of gender mainstreaming is being defined by the European Union as: the systematic integration of the respective situations, priorities and needs of women and men in all policies with a view to promoting equality between men and women and mobilising all general policies and measures specifically for the purpose of achieving equality by actively and openly taking into account, at the planning stage, of their effects on the respective situation of women and men during the implementation, monitoring and evaluation phases. (European Commission communication, COM (96) 67 final and 21.2.1996) For a discussion of "mainstreaming" in cultural policy making see: Cliche/Mitchell/Wiesand. *Pyramid or Pillars: unveiling the status of women in arts and media professions in Europe*, Arcult Media, Bonn 2000.

to begin working on a mainstreaming strategy for gender equality in the arts and culture. While being able to respond to the concerns of those "against" specialised measures for various minority groups, mainstreaming strategies alone have been quite general. Caution has been drawn to the fact that without identifying specific activities within mainstreaming strategies, the needs of different groups may simply be replaced by more pressing political priorities.

Constant monitoring of existing programmes would help to bring some clarity into this general debate.

Below is a summary of various public measures that support diverse artistic and cultural expression. This list was generated from the material available in the reports which implies that it is not exhaustive but representative of the different approaches applied in the countries under study.

2.1.1 Re-examining funding criteria

Diversity in cultural policies means re-examining the ways in which creativity and professional life as an artist are defined and subsequently supported by public schemes. *Excellence* continues to be a measuring stick for *success* and *success* continues to be defined by romantic concepts of *greatness* and *genius* which can be achieved via public recognition and economic rewards of the marketplace. Such indicators and criteria do not lend themselves to an open framework or a level playing field which can recognise all talents that demonstrate creativity, innovation and professionalism in the artistic field.

Some efforts are underway in countries such as Canada to begin a process that will redefine main areas central to diversifying resources beyond mainstream art forms and ideas. For example, over the past decade, the Canada Council for the Arts has undertaken a review of:

- the criteria used to evaluate funding applications
- the definition and scope of artistic disciplines/practice beyond conventional art forms
- the composition of juries and panels adjudicating grants

On a provincial level, the Ontario Arts Council has also taken some important steps to redefine the scope of *community* in "Community Arts" beyond geography to include groups organised according to ethnicity or language. Other arts councils across the country have incorporated programmes that support diverse artistic production.

Such practices are also found in Sweden and South Africa.

2.1.2 Direct support for specified groups of artists

Direct support allocated to certain groups of artists is favoured by many countries rather than undertaking major institutional or programme reforms which may be required to address cultural diversity in the broader sense mentioned above; the latter is perceived by many countries as more difficult. Examples of target funding programmes are, however, less numerous than expected. The objective of those which do exist has been to grant access of various groups of artists to national funding schemes. For example, in South Africa, applications are available in many of the recognised national minority languages. Grants are also given to specific ethno racial groups: e.g. the South African National Arts Council gives grants to black emerging artists.

2.1.3 Structural measures

Some countries have set up special offices or advisory boards to focus specifically on the needs of particular groups or communities of artists including:

- In Canada: an Advisory Committee for Racial Equality in the Arts and the Aboriginal Arts Secretariat at the Canada Council for the Arts. The Aboriginal Representative Organisations Program (AROP) administered by the Department of Canadian Heritage which consults the government of cultural issues of relevance to the Aboriginal peoples.
- In Sweden: The *Sametinget* is the central authority dealing with Sami matters and is financed by the Swedish government. It receives a State subsidy for cultural activities (libraries, theatre, arts and crafts, contemporary arts and media), research and social development projects.

2.1.4 Measures to ensure or increase the representation of different groups in decision-making processes in the arts

The individual country reports indicate that formal mechanisms such as quota systems are not being used as a tool to increase the representation of minority groups on funding boards or juries (mainstreaming), on staff of cultural institutions and in decision-making positions. In some of the countries surveyed, the governments rely on artists associations to nominate members to national grant giving committees in the form of peer review (Hungary, Sweden). In South Africa, no measures are being taken by the government, but it rather relies on artists themselves to ensure equal representation: "No quotas have been set to ensure equal representation in arts and culture institutions, but the Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology (DACST) ensures that women and black people are well represented in arts councils". However, public cultural institutions are still predominantly managed by Whites.

2.1.5 Public recognition - special awards

Research has shown that there is an under-representation of minority and other groups among the recipients of major awards or scholarships in the arts and media fields². This has led, in some countries, to the creation of specially targeted awards or prizes.

- *Special awards/scholarships given to targeted groups (artistic content)*: The Canadian National Aboriginal Achievement Awards / Youth Scholarship Award of Aboriginal heritage. Special awards are not normally given to minority groups or to the Sami artists in Sweden.
- *Special awards given to groups who promote the principles of diversity (social message)*: In Hungary, "Awards for Minorities" are handed over to groups and individuals who have excelled in promoting the cause and values of minorities. These awards are given on the official "Day of Minorities" declared by the Hungarian government following the adoption of a UN Resolution on the rights of minorities on the 18th of December in 1992.
- *Support for the public recognition of certain groups*: The South African government launched 9 August as Women's Day, and in 2000, published a book honouring pioneer women in all sectors of society, and specifically politics and arts and culture. In Canada, National Aboriginal Day, June 21st, recognises the cultural diversity and contributions of Inuit, Métis and First Nations Peoples.

2.1.6 Co-operation (public- private, public-third sector, intergovernmental)

There have been various co-operative initiatives in recent years between the public and private sector as well as between the public sector and local communities in the arts and media which have also involved diversity-projects. Below are a few examples of such co-operation mentioned in the country studies.

² Cliche/Mitchell/Wiesand. *Pyramid or Pillars*, Arcult Media, Bonn 2000.

- *Programmes run jointly between different levels of government and the private sector:* In 1998 the Canada Council for the Arts, in conjunction with provincial and local arts councils and private sector foundations in several cities across the country, supported a series of pilot projects under the banner of Artists in Communities. The Culture in Community Programme in South Africa has established 43 community arts centres and libraries, providing access to art education, cultural recreation and economic production, primarily to poor Black communities. In most cases local people manage these centres, while municipal councils or provincial departments maintain the infrastructure.
- *Policies and programmes connecting different ministries (inter-ministerial co-operation):* programme in South Africa linking indigenous artists and art production with economic empowerment, job creation and tourism.
- *Programmes run in co-operation with other governments:* public moral support given to Senegalese-Swiss HELSEN cultural network and its program "Femmes en création". In addition, the Senegalese "Programme de Soutien aux initiatives Culturelles" (PSIC) was established in co-operation with the European Union to provide financial support to individual projects of emerging artists.

2.1.7 Public programmes and measures to support the production and distribution of works by specific groups/communities of artists

Recognising that institutional change is slow, specialised programmes, events and funds have been set up in the different countries to support those groups which are currently excluded from the mainstream. One of the main fears is that, while such initiatives are required to recognise their achievements, policy makers may not view them as "transitory tools" but rather as permanent mechanisms. Below is an overview of current activities running in the countries surveyed.

- *Transnational, national, regional and local festivals and special arts events* are important activities to provide various groups with the possibility having a venue to disseminate their work and to network with colleagues in an environment where the artistic work is the focus. Festivals such as those organised by arts organisations such as *Desh Pardesh* in Toronto, Canada have been successful in responding to diverse artistic and community needs by profiling the work of South Asian artists and arts organisations. The Department of Canadian Heritage's Cultural Initiatives Program is currently being revised to focus support on festivals that profile culturally diverse arts and artists. The Program supports over 160 Festivals and Special Arts Events across the country.
Festivals can also be beneficial to revive living cultural forms which have disappeared from the cultural landscape. In South Africa, traditional music from rural areas has made a comeback through cultural festivals, while the archives aim to collect examples through the oral history project. They also provide the possibility for unknown artists to have a means of distributions for their work (helping to overcome obstacles presented by mainstream cultural institutions and venues).
- *Public funding for the production and distribution of media programmes targeted to specific communities:* Canadian examples include the Aboriginal Television Network, Native Communications Societies, WETV – a new multicultural Toronto-based television station, and an "urban" FM radio station in Toronto with a largely black audience. Distribution assistance is available to minority official language and ethnic community weekly newspapers including publications in 11 different languages. In Sweden, there is limited funding available for the promotion of literature and periodicals with cultural content as well as radio and television programmes

produced in Sami, Torne valley -Finnish and Finnish.

- *General policy support to groups or societies for the production or distribution of works* (works are not necessarily targeted to special audiences) The South African National Film and Video Foundation Act specifically promotes women producers, like the Women of the Sun collective or the funding programmes of the Canadian National Film Board which actively seek out filmmakers from minority communities.
- *Public funding in the form of grants* are given to cultural institutions whose main focus is the work of specific groups. These include libraries for minority cultures (Hungary, South Africa) museums (Sami and Jewish museums in Sweden receive minor annual grant) or cultural centres (National Gypsy Cultural Centre was founded in Hungary in 1999).
- There are some programmes which provide *aid for artist-run or controlled production and distribution facilities* as venues for contemporary, often avant-garde artists to collaborate and exhibit their work. For example, Canadian media artists receive some grants from the Canada Council and from the various provincial arts councils. In other countries, some support is generated from the private sector, but is not sufficient to cover the capital intensive and human resource costs of experimentation in the field of multimedia / media arts. One of the priorities of the Soros Foundation for Contemporary Arts has been to actively support the work of artists engaged in more advanced experimental work using new technologies.

Basket 3: Promoting Diversity in a Global Economy

3.1 "Diversity-competition" practices in globalising markets

Since the mid-70's, there has been a common viewpoint among different countries - in Europe e.g. France or the Nordic States, as well as in Canada - that public policy should try to balance the "negative effects of commercialisation". In more recent times, this viewpoint has been reinterpreted as the need for countries to address the deficit of diverse expression in competitive markets for cultural goods and services. Such deficits have often been caused by an overwhelming presence of multinational companies or by national monopolies which have dominated an entire market or segments of it.

Two basic policy options have been developed to counteract the concentration of ownership and effective control of cultural production and markets in few hands:

- 1) *Direct support measures*: grants and other forms of financial assistance provided to:
 - individual artists for their projects and/or working environment
 - the culture industries which produce or disseminate their work (content)Such measures are designed to help bring artists into a position from which they can compete against the mainstream products of big business.
- 2) *Indirect supporting measures*: political or legal frameworks whose objectives are to help safeguard or restore diversity of goods and services to the marketplace as well as to increase the chances for quality or authentic content to hold its own in a competitive environment. Examples of such measures include media content regulation, import restrictions, price guarantees, quality control, economic start-up programmes and loans at fair interest rates.

While the first of these measures calls for an active culture and media policy, the second requires co-operation and links to other areas of policy including economic or regional development programmes. For example, in most of the countries surveyed, the task of preserving or promoting creative or cultural diversity often starts with language related policies which eventually lead to the adoption of cultural policy measures such as quota systems for media programming.

In globalising markets, support measures for domestic content producers and their productions are sometimes seen as protectionist by multinational competitors. This has become a challenge to the equally important task of obtaining access for domestic products and services in foreign markets. The latter will be difficult to achieve if national governments apply full-fledged "closed shop" policies. Such practices may even arouse public concern if there is an increasing absence of some popular or successfully marketed foreign programmes and products.

3.2 Direct support measures for domestic content development and production

The limitations of marketplace resources to support the production and distribution of domestic content (e.g. television programmes) could be the result of:

- inadequate national infrastructure
- limited investment from the public and private sectors
- relaxed import regulations
- lower costs of purchasing foreign rather than domestic products
- limited buying power of consumers

The effect has been, in many cases, insufficient representation of local talent and overwhelming presence or even complete domination of foreign goods and services on a domestic market. Gov-

ernments in some countries have tried to intervene to make up for such deficits (imbalances). The goals of their measures have mostly been to safeguard national identity and cultural (including linguistic) diversity within their own markets. Efforts have been mainly concentrated in the audiovisual/media sector.

3.2.1 Direct support measures for domestic content creation/development

The goal of these measures is to provide direct financial assistance for production and distribution companies as well as for individual artists, their projects and/or working environment in order to ensure the availability of domestic cultural expression. Below is an overview of measures undertaken by the countries surveyed.

a) Establishment of special "cultural content" funds:

- Canada has created several such funds in the audiovisual media field including the Canadian Television Fund (CTF) and the Feature Film Fund. They support production in a market which, due to US dominance, maintains only a 3% domestic share of the revenues from feature films (the share is much higher in television and radio).
- In Senegal, the national government has a support fund for the press and another for film. Both of them are largely under-funded.
- In Hungary, there are ongoing discussions about introducing a special levy on foreign (mainly American) movies to provide funds for the production of Hungarian films. Television channels are required to spend 6% of their net income on Hungarian film and TV productions.
- In South Africa, the Film Development Fund provides grants to film producers, new directors and script writers. Particular attention is provided to local training.

b) Grant systems for individual authors and other creative professions:

The goal is to improve the economic status and conditions for artists' work (=domestic production)

- Sweden has an extensive support system for individual creative artists: working grants, project grants, travel grants, income guarantees, pensions, exhibition rights, library compensations and others. A larger part of the funding for such measures come from returns generated by Public Lending Right (which is administered outside the general copyright licensing scheme). In 2000, the PLR generated over 12 million EURO for authors' grants or similar measures.

c) Co-operative ventures between the public and private sectors:

The goal of these efforts are to share the responsibility for raising the necessary financial resources for capital intensive or expensive domestic production which the State alone can not cover.

- In Sweden, an agreement was made between the State, the film industry and television companies to provide additional funds to domestic film production (this agreement is renewable every 4 years).
- The Media Development and Diversity Agency in South Africa brings together government, private sector media and foreign founders to invest equally in media that promotes diversity³. The government has been establishing additional partnerships with the private sector via the Business and Arts South Africa (BASA) and the President's Arts and Culture Trust.

³ This initiative has not been entirely successful due to the low level of resources provided by the private sector.

d) *Joint action on the part of different national and international bodies or development schemes:*

- Collaborative efforts of the South Africa National Arts Council include activities undertaken with the Poverty Relief Programme, Culture Industries Growth Strategy and the Spatial Development Initiative which together provide funds to craft-based projects.
- Senegal receives support from the EU to diversify content production (PSIC) and support to training and distribution by the French co-operative movement (PASEC). A proposal for a cultural resources development programme (PRODEC) has been submitted to the World Bank. SONATEL, the national telecommunications corporation, is expected to establish a private foundation which would provide support for such activities.

Information regarding the relative success of these direct measures remains scarce and would require further investigation. Generally speaking, one cannot overlook the fact that public aid has not been able to stop the increase in foreign (primarily US) film- and TV-programmes being distributed by multinational companies or the success of world-music in music stores. However, this does not answer the question about the nature and viability of the market, programming schemes and consumer buying patterns, *without* some form of public aid.

3.2.2 Direct support measures for small and medium sized enterprises in the arts and media

Responsibility for contemporary artistic, literary and journalistic, audiovisual or musical "content" production and distribution has been shifting from large State-controlled monopolies to a greater reliance on the private sector (e.g. publishers, galleries, recording labels or production studios). Today, private enterprises often come in the form of multinational companies which are dominating fields such as the music industry, film distribution and publishing (sometimes the publishing branches of these companies are melting into "multimedia" firms). Culture and media concentration processes tend, at least in the longer run, to diminish the possibility for choice both for the "creators" and the "users" and, therefore, a true diversity of styles or genres can no longer be guaranteed. For those markets which are still in development inexperienced commercial firms and the downfall of former State facilities continue to pose serious challenges.

Relatively few measures were found which directly support SME's in the arts and media. Below is an overview of the responses provided. In some cases they are individual measures with relatively small impact.

- a) In some of the countries surveyed, measures in favour of SME's tend to be part of general economic and regional development policies and do not necessarily provide significant benefits to SME's working in the arts and media fields.
 - In Sweden, for example, SME's are part of the special regional growth agreements between the government and the regional bodies.
 - In South Africa, measures to empower SME's, such as the Women's Enterprise Initiative Programme, are administered by the Department of Trade and Industry and are usually focused on non-art production.
- b) Plans to support SME's are in development or blocked due to lack of resources
 - Senegal has recently applied for special cultural resources from a World Bank development programme called PRODEC. Such resources would be spent on the promotion of SME's involved in the production, distribution, marketing, conservation and restoration of works in the fields of the pictorial, visual and graphic arts, sculpture, architecture, crafts, books, etc.
 - Despite recent investigations which contain recommendations for the promotion of the culture industries, few measures exist to operationalise strategies for SME's in South Africa. This is partly attributed to the divide existing between the national departments which develop policies and programmes and the provincial departments which lack the resources and capacity to implement such

measures. The Department of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology is presently developing a Geographic Information System based database of cultural venues and outlets on the internet.

- c) There are indirect policy measures which have a direct impact on SME's.
 - In Hungary, the Act on Radio and Television stipulates that a minimum of 15% of programmes broadcast on national and regional channels must originate from independent producers and artists. Although this regulation is not directed explicitly to small and medium sized enterprises, experts consider that they are the ones which profit most from this policy decision.
- d) Large scale cultural institutions attract more support from big business than do smaller companies.
 - In South Africa, there have been complaints that most of the commissions granted by the public South-African Broadcasting Organisation are given to larger companies.
 - Local and regional film or art festivals have been used as alternative venues for artists and SME's to distribute their products which would not otherwise be carried by the large-scale institutions.
- e) Direct support for artist or community controlled production and distribution facilities
 - In South Africa, some public support is available for artist-run galleries or concert agencies for women musicians.
 - The Canada Council for the Arts (arm's length body) provides funding for artist run centres.

3.2.3 Support to local emerging talents and businesses

Individual artists and smaller businesses trying to enter the marketplace or launch new products have, in many cases, to face a shortage of investment funds or problems in trying to obtain loans from local banks without so-called "bankable" securities. Therefore, some countries have put different measures in place such as:

- Start-up programmes (credit schemes, consulting and re-training services etc.)
- Loans at fair interest rates or interest-free.

Such measures, if weighed against regular grant or award schemes, have the advantage of low administration costs and the potential of a investment "back flow" to the awarding fund or administration (in the case of loans). Most of the programmes mentioned are geared to the needs of specific segments of the culture industries.

- In Canada, the Kick Start programme provides support to emerging directors in the production of short films or videos. The Features First programme, carried out in collaboration with the National Screen Institute offers professional development and project support for filmmakers. In the music field, two main programmes exist: FACTOR (Foundation to Assist Canadian Talent on Records) and Musicaction, its counterpart for the French segment of the Canadian industry. They also contribute to the production of recordings as well as marketing and touring support for First Nations/Aboriginal Peoples artists and for projects by artists from different ethnic/cultural groups.
- In Hungary, there is a low interest credit scheme for developing the book sector which is run by the cultural ministry jointly with a commercial bank.
- In South Africa, the Film and Video Initiative and the Film Development Fund provide discretionary and outright grants to stimulate film producers, new directors and script writers. Particular attention is to be paid to training. Programmes such as Khula Enterprise Finance Limited provide access to initial capital but have yet to be discovered by businesses in the arts and media field.

3.3 Indirect measures to stimulate production and distribution

There are two traditional forms of indirect measures to stimulate production and distribution in the arts and media which have been mentioned in the countries surveyed: fiscal or economic incentives and content regulations. Below is a sampling of measures adopted by the different countries.

3.3.1 Fiscal incentives or economic policies

There are few indirect economic policies and measures influencing the culture industries market. The most commonly used are anti-trust policies and related monitoring activities. Of the countries studied, only two -- Canada and Hungary -- identified measures which are specifically incorporated in their public policies and programmes: tax-related allowances or incentives and price regulations.

- the Canadian Film and Video Production Tax Credit
- preferential VAT rate for books in Hungary (paying 12% rather than the regular 25% rate)

One measure worth mentioning is the *fixed book price* applied in many European countries. The goal of this measure is to encourage booksellers to invest in a wider stock (including special interest titles or those appealing only to smaller minorities) and to keep prices generally stable. In those countries where the fixed book price system was abolished, such as in Sweden, the individual price of books has generally increased and many medium-sized bookshops died out, while larger chain stores, which offer e.g. best-sellers at reduced prices remained in the market. The same type of measure was applied to the music industry. However, when the fixed prices were abolished only a few labels survived and there was an increase in pirated or illegal copies.

3.3.2 Domestic (media) content regulations, e.g. quota and licensing prerequisites

Despite all expectations, content regulations, criteria for licenses and specific production or dissemination incentives have not disappeared from the policy landscape, especially in the field of the audiovisual media. On the contrary, international comparative research carried out for the *3rd Culture Industries Report*⁴ revealed an increase in their use if compared to the situation 15-20 years ago. In that report, 8 different types of regulations were found in broadcasting, some of them also relevant in the countries surveyed for this study:

1. Flexible public monitoring of programme content
2. Soft quotas: general programming obligations stated in the general principles of obligations of broadcasters or non-binding parliamentary opinions; (e.g. the EU-Directive of April 1989)
3. Flat rate: foreign content quotas
4. Specified or weighted quotas: for domestic programming, taking into account e.g. ownership and legal status of the broadcaster and broadcasting techniques (e.g. cable vs. antenna); size of audience/airtime (e.g. "prime time" programming); programme sector (e.g. feature films or music); use of languages and/or languages of production; use of domestic professionals or producing firms
5. Specific programming obligations: e.g. a minimum of productions in specific content areas (e.g. concerts or art criticism); minimum airtime for specific content areas (e.g. cultural information); regional or local programmes; programming for special interest groups or minorities etc.; independent production companies
6. Financial obligations: % of turnover or of advertising revenues to be re-invested mostly in production funds; % of programme investments must be of domestic origin
7. Licensing obligations

⁴ Arbeitsgemeinschaft Kulturwirtschaft: *Kultureller Arbeitsmarkt und Verflechtungen*, Report for the Ministry of the Economy of the State of North-Rhine Westphalia, Düsseldorf, 1998.

8. Other regulations and policies: including anti-trust laws, staff obligations like the "cartes professionnelles", dubbing-policies etc.

Concerns over strengthening national "cultural identity" or contributing to domestic labour market growth in the face of globalisation and integration have resulted in the adoption of such measures (their effectiveness would require further in-depth research). The study has indicated that there has been a significant move away from purely "prohibitive quotas" (type No. 3) in favour of more "pro-active measures" favouring domestic content production and distribution, e.g. in the form of levies generated from the advertising revenues of private companies which are transferred into specific production funds. Some of the national regulations include very detailed descriptions of how much cultural content should be broadcast every month.

These regulatory measures have always been controversial, especially for the American-based "Majors" of the audiovisual industry. Various arguments in favour of open markets, quality, freedom of editorial choice and safeguarding the media sphere against State intervention have been used in the ongoing content regulation debates. There is the belief and experience, however, that such measures are essential to help compensate for the limited size of markets in some countries, especially since not all of the cultural production of one country is attractive or transferable to audiences across the variety of markets world-wide. In this context, regulations are actually seen as a means to restore competitiveness against products from larger foreign markets such as the USA, which have a much greater chance to recover their production investments within their own diversified and highly profitable market.

In the countries surveyed, the following national or local content *quotas* and similar measures such as foreign ownership regulations in radio and TV were mentioned or could otherwise be determined:

- Canada: Content regulations for radio and television which define "Canadian Content" via the producers and key creative personnel employed in the production of e.g. feature films and similar programmes, have always been among the most complex and specific in the world (next only to France). Guided by the *Broadcasting Act 1991*, CRTC regulations for television stipulate a general rate of 60% Canadian content to be guaranteed during the year, with some minor exceptions for private broadcasters. Quotas for radio stipulate, as a general rule, a minimum weekly requirement of 35% Canadian content in all popular musical selections (with exceptions for broadcasters with a high amount of instrumental music and specific airtime rules for the main listening time between 6 a.m. and 6 p.m.). Ethnic radio and TV stations are required to devote 60% of their programming to ethnic productions and must observe a third language programming quota of 50%.

Foreign investment guidelines are applied to the cultural industries and broadcasting, directed not so much at diversity as on economic considerations. The Department of Canadian Heritage is responsible to review and approve (or deny) foreign investments related to the culture industries under the *Investment Canada Act*.

- South Africa: There is a 50% domestic content quota in public broadcasting. A proposal for a 20% quota of local content on private television companies has been made; at present, a 5% local content quota exists for the pay TV channel M-Net (20% quotas on "open time hours"). Quotas on local content in broadcasting have been most successful with regard to music played on the radio and less successful is the promotion of domestic films aired on television. Commentators have indicated that without government subsidies, it would be difficult to enforce these quotas.

Import regulations on foreign cultural goods such as films or music have eased off. Co-productions between South African and foreign companies have largely failed due to loose policies

and lack of incentives. More guidelines and incentives from government and labour have been recommended in special reports with the objective to stimulate the potential for export and for developing partnerships with foreign companies.

- Hungary: The *1996 Radio and Television Act* stipulates a music quota of 30% domestic content in public service radio and 15% in other stations. For public service television channels (in Hungary there are two such television companies, one of them broadcasting on two channels which in fact makes three altogether) the quotas are as follows: the minimum yearly average of Hungarian productions is 51% and 70% for European products. In addition to the yearly ceilings, the two figures must not fall below 30% and 51% in any one month. This quota also covers Hungarian films (20% is the minimum).

There has been a recent conflict between the current Hungarian quota system in favour of local content and EU regulations. This conflict has caused one of the most heated arguments during the accession process to the European Union.

Foreign ownership is not promoted but limited to a maximum of 74% in national radio and television stations; even if the actual ownership is over 50%. The majority of company boards must consist of a certain % of Hungarian citizens.

The country reports from Senegal and Sweden did not report any quota schemes of this nature.

3.4 Public support for the promotion of domestic traditions, goods and services

There are some policies and institutional programmes which aim to create a more general acceptance and recognition of domestic traditions and cultural goods. Some of these policies are designed with the intention to "educate" potential audiences, readers etc. as early as possible and in doing so create better conditions for the future functioning of domestic markets in which these products or services can be offered. The impetus for these policies and programmes is the recognition that there are "knowledge deficits" regarding, for example, indigenous culture(s) and languages.

- Sweden has programmes designed to promote its own language through libraries, research institutions, literature grants, media and education projects. In recent years, the Government has laid great emphasis on children's reading and speaking via special support to library purchases of books for children and young people and to reading campaigns. School libraries have been studied in order to improve their functions and status.
- According to the report from Senegal, domestic art "is promoted by the national gallery of contemporary art, the Museum of African Art, the Village des Arts, and private galleries (all in the Dakar region). In the performing arts, there is the Théâtre National Daniel SORANO in Dakar (1200 seats) and the Pyramide culturelle du Sénégal (Studio 2000) as well as a growing number of street theatres, shows in cybercafés etc. A national book fair is organised every year at the Maison de la Culture Doua SECK (Dakar)."
- In Hungary, the present government is very conscious about national values and the responsible Ministry even acts as a producer of large films about themes from national history. These films attract 10-20 times as many spectators as the average Hungarian film. There is also a network of art cinemas run and supported by the local government of Budapest. Traditional Hungarian peasant dance music is quite popular, also with younger people and has blended with modern forms of pop music.
- Fostering knowledge of Canadian history, values and symbols is one of the core priorities of the federal Department of Canadian Heritage as well as of Canada's national cultural institutions. Recently, the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation has sponsored a multi-part television series

called "A People's History" which reached unprecedented audience ratings as well as a radio programme called "New Voices" designed to promote the works of visible minorities which are not included in the mainstream programmes of its English Radio Network.

- The Department of Arts, Culture, Science, Technology South Africa is currently preparing an Indigenous Knowledge System (IKS) Bill which is designed to promote indigenous culture as part of an overall strategy to foster an African Renaissance. The Department has also initiated the "Legacy Project" in co-operation with other ministries. Through the 1998 Culture Institutions Act, museums have been targeted to counter their entrenched apartheid thinking in their conservation policies and exhibition programmes.

IV. Observations resulting from the Pilot Phase of "All Talents Count"

Below is a preliminary list of observations which resulted from this pilot exercise. They should not be considered as the only ones upon which common indicators at the international level could be built. The addition of countries from Asia or Latin America, for example, would surely provide other perspectives from which future exercises would greatly benefit and lead to a better understanding of the general trends, patterns and instruments of cultural diversity in cultural policy making. An evaluation of results from other regional and international exercises, for example the Council of Europe project on cultural diversity, could be beneficial in order to achieve a more comprehensive analysis and understanding of this highly complex concept.

1. Some general trends

There has been a marked increase in *immigration* among different types of immigrants, ranging from refugees (transitory immigrants) to asylum seekers as well as those immigrants who are granted citizenship status. There are some official programmes to help immigrants adjust to life in their new country from settlement policies (Canada) to media programming in mother-tongue languages of the largest immigrant groups (Hungary). It has, however, been reported that intolerance of "citizens" towards "foreigners" or "immigrant others" is growing in some countries (South Africa, Canada).

The daily or home use of *languages* which are not recognised officially as minority languages is growing in accordance with immigration patterns. Linguistically defined cultural communities with shared values (which could be within a metropole or on a border region) are emerging and are posing questions on the traditional ways of defining territories (e.g. political boundaries). There have been recent efforts by governments to develop programmes to revive or address the diminishing use of indigenous languages or the languages of large groups of minorities.

There has been a marked increase in the *concentration of media* ownership by few multinational corporations who control the process of cultural production and distribution in countries around the world. There has also been a rise in the amount of foreign content on the domestic audiovisual landscape (mostly in the fields of film, television and sound recording). Together these trends have had a direct impact not only on cultural policy frameworks and measures but on the more general trade debates taking place on regional and global levels. Responses are, however, mixed and in some cases conflicting: on the one hand there has been a significant rise in the use of quotas for domestic media content production and, on the other hand, a partial relaxation of import regulations on cultural goods and services.

Culture diversity as a component of *cultural policy* and practices has manifested itself in various ways. First, there has been an increase in:

- the rhetorical use by policy making bodies of cultural diversity as an instrument in the context of "social cohesion"
- the number of programmes and activities to safeguard national cultural identity and values via the media as well as more general civic, cultural or citizenship education programmes
- parallel efforts by policy makers to define artists according to groups (blacks, women, disabled etc) which are coupled with targeted measures of direct support for such groups
- activities to protect and promote both tangible and intangible cultural heritage (sometimes used as a means to help "defend" the nation-state against the effects of globalisation) including measures to increase the use of official languages which may be losing ground on the world linguistic map
- the use of festivals as an alternative means to distribute contemporary cultural production and other works not recognised under mainstream funding systems

- reliance on staff to uphold culture diversity principles rather than developing a strategic or policy direction

On the other hand, there have been few:

- plans for major institutional reforms which would take up culture diversity as its fundamental basis (such major exercises would require a re-examination of how *success*, *artistic quality* and *excellence* are defined and then applied in policy and grant making structures such as the efforts taking place in Canada)
- support measures or funding opportunities for SME's working in the fields of arts and media
- NGO *watchdogs* over the application of diversity concepts in culture and media policies and programmes

One of the main debates regarding the application of culture diversity in policy making has been how to strike a balance between:

- A) ***specialised institutions, programmes, events or funding mechanisms*** to support those groups and individual talents (e.g. who are producing new cultural forms) which are currently excluded from the mainstream institutions, programmes and funding sources
- B) "***mainstreaming***" as a relatively recent policy concept to systematically integrate currently marginalised groups and contemporary artistic practices into the heart of policy making, programme development and funding.

Neither one or the other approach would alone appear to be sufficient.

While the debate goes on, the reports also reveal that:

- there are few publicly funded culture and media programmes which reflect ethno-cultural communities needs (e.g. local content programming in mother-tongue languages)
- while many countries in this study have reported the use of content quotas in media programming, they have not adopted the use of quotas as a tool to, for example, increase the number of different groups in decision making positions (on grant giving bodies). A more *laissez-faire* approach is being taken as governments rely more and more on their staff to ensure diversity in decision-making
- there are insufficient public and private resources to invest in community based projects and businesses which are required to help different groups of artists or media professionals overcome market inequalities and other challenges. At the moment, it appears that much of the innovation is coming from the third sector, for example, community run media programmes
- there is a need to establish programmes which are specifically designed to redistribute resources equally among all groups of artists and media professionals and individual talents
- activities or programmes (including exchanges) have been created to provide young people with the knowledge about the variety of cultures within their own national borders or with other cultures around the world

In the context of the broader ***human rights*** framework, the reports indicate that public discussions or debates on the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* are rare or have been relegated to forums of specialised groups of lawyers, political scientists, researchers from different disciplines, etc. To date, there are few specific legislative attempts by national governments to bring articles of human rights into cultural policies. Cultural rights remains an underdeveloped field in general, however, there are several basic principles which can be found at the core of cultural policy development ranging from freedom of expression and creation (for artists) to the right to participate in the cultural life of the community (for audiences).

2. Is there a diversity of approaches to diversity in cultural policy making?

The table below demonstrates that there is a policy (political) rhetoric developing on the topic of culture diversity which could be considered somewhat similar among the different countries (c.f. keywords). Some of the common messages emerging from the country reports include:

- pre-defined national identity and values are to be protected and promoted as a public priority
- extra public efforts are needed to promote social cohesion within national borders
- cultural diversity in cultural policy making is a tool to protect local and domestic cultural production against globalisation and commercialisation trends

This list does not necessarily mean that there is a uniform approach among countries when implementing or interpreting cultural diversity principles into national cultural policy frameworks. Indeed the reports have shown that the approach of individual countries can range from: an extensive system of support for artists (content producers) to renewed focused on cultural institutions to promote national cultural heritage (both physical and intangible). The *local* context of each country is also important to consider including: immigration patterns and population make-up, degrees of foreign ownership in domestic culture and media landscapes, resources available for culture, the arts and media in general, cultural policy making traditions and instruments, political approaches towards diversity etc.

	Cultural Diversity Context	Consequences for Policy Making
Canada Keywords: social cohesion, domestic content	A highly complex and controversial process which has acknowledged diversity as a fundamental characteristic of Canadian life, but which has been criticized by some equity seeking groups as being slow to “operationalize” this commitment in practical terms in the cultural sector. Today, cultural diversity discussions are often held under the rubric of social cohesion and global trade.	Tension between a focus on reforming "mainstream" institutions and strategies aimed at supporting specific (separated) communities. Culture and media infrastructure mainly supports English and French language content and services (and more recently some Aboriginal programming). Strong tradition of content quotas in media programming, but less relevant in the performing or visual arts.
Hungary Keywords: protection and promotion of national heritage	From 1994-98, the liberal party placed multiculturalism high on the agenda with emphasis on a wide range of minority groups (not just ethnic minorities). Today, the politics has placed emphasis on the other side of the "diversity" coin: to protect and promote national heritage as a means to defend the nation against the effects of globalisation.	Renewed attention to national cultural institutions. Measures are conceived as investments in local (national) production to provide a "diversity balance" against foreign products. International festivals are the main vehicle to provide alternative content. There are no programmes or quota systems to regulate the involvement of minorities in cultural life.
Senegal Keywords: de-regulation to promote diversity	Cultural diversity policies are more about relinquishing State control over cultural production than about the promotion of any particular national or ethnic minority group in the country.	Policies remain in the theoretical development stage and are accused of being ill-defined and under-funded. Resources are being sought from the private sector and international organisations such as the World Bank.
South Africa Keywords. Social capital, economic empowerment, redistribution of resources	The arts and culture -- in the larger sense -- are being used to promote social capital, economic empowerment and to develop people's identity. Culture diversity is being developed to bring about "social cohesion" and to facilitate the redistribution of resources which were previously directed to the White community. It is clearly an important element of the government's "rainbow nation" policy.	Specialised grant and funding schemes which emphasise poor communities from different "groups": emphasis on poor black communities
Sweden Keywords: strengthen domestic artistic diversity and media programming	Fundamental principle of culture policy is to counteract the negative effects of commercialisation by strengthening artistic diversity and media programming within Swedish borders.	Extensively funded system of support to creative life (both creation and participation of citizens), especially community development and local cultural life.

3. The "Quota Experiment"

The questionnaire provided us with the opportunity to monitor the relationship between policy discourse and policy action, albeit in an experimental manner, on some measures which have been designed to protect and promote domestic cultural production in the media. The most well known content regulation is the quota system which comes in various forms (cf. 3.3.2). Studies have shown that there is an increase in the use of quotas in the media which has not necessarily transferred to the arts and culture sectors. While media quotas have been highly controversial, especially in global trade negotiations, three of the countries surveyed -- Canada, Hungary and South Africa -- have indicated strong content regulation systems and different measures which both encourage and deter foreign investment (ownership) and importation of foreign cultural goods and services. No official media content regulations/quotas were reported from Senegal or Sweden.

Question 5.4.5 asked respondents to indicate which of the statements below could be considered more or less acceptable in prevailing national approaches to media policies in general and to content regulations in particular. Each of the statements were taken from a list of arguments which are often employed both in favour and against quotas. Canada chose not to reply feeling that the questions as presented could lead to false conclusions.

The result of the experiment could, nevertheless, suggest that there is not necessarily a clear link between the policy discourse in support of "content diversity" and those regulations or policy measures which are sometimes adopted by national governments.

ARGUMENTS NORMALLY USED IN DEBATES AGAINST USE OF QUOTAS

	Strongly Support	Accept	Reject
Media regulations can not really reduce the amount of foreign goods and services distributed in the country due to new communication technologies such as cable, satellite, Internet.		Senegal Hungary Sweden	South Africa
Content quotas in the arts and media are against the general trends of globalisation, competition and free trade.		Senegal Hungary Sweden	South Africa
Content regulations lead to bureaucracy and do not give media professionals the freedom to develop their own programming criteria.		Senegal	South Africa Hungary Sweden

ARGUMENTS NORMALLY USED IN DEBATES IN FAVOUR OF QUOTAS

	Strongly Support	Accept	Reject
Indigenous productions need to be protected against foreign products because audiences want programmes and products in their own language and cultural traditions.	Senegal	South Africa Sweden Hungary	
Cultural goods and services, even if privately run, should not be confused with regular economic goods and services to be traded on the international market.	Senegal South Africa Sweden	Hungary	
Since broadcasters are using audience ratings as their criteria for programme selection, they might as well also take government regulations into account.		Senegal	South Africa
International programmes produced by large media groups foster stereotyped viewing and listening habits and in the long run affect cultural diversity and creativity.	Senegal South Africa Hungary	Sweden	

"ALL TALENTS COUNT" - QUESTIONNAIRE

Experts are asked to answer the questions below in the form of a country profile or report. Clearly, not all arts or media fields or societal groups can be covered in such a short paper. Examples should be used as much as possible to illustrate various policy measures and incentives. Remember that these are not official government documents and should present diverse points of view. Those questions where blanks or check boxes are provided should be answered directly on this survey and explained in the profile. Questions which have been marked by a * should be answered by making reference to the following (if not already specified):

- a) brief description of the general situation/structures
- b) refer to specific public measures or programmes
- c) describe recent debates (for example on the applicability of measures; new plans, etc.)

1. Background information

This section of the paper should provide general information which will be used to contextualize the specific measures and incentives to foster diversity asked for in sections 2-5.

- 1.1 Short overview of the governmental system in your country e.g. federal state, in as much as it relates to this exercise.

Ethnic minorities and language diversity

- 1.2 Provide data on the population breakdown according to majority and minority groups including indigenous populations and immigrants.
- 1.3 What are the official languages in your country?
 those used by public authorities _____
 those used in schools _____
- 1.4 Which are the officially recognised ethnic minorities and languages in your country? Are they concentrated in a certain geographic area?
- 1.5 Are there large groups of immigrants or "foreign nationals"? If so, which ones and in what numbers? Please explain.
- 1.6 Are ethnic or language minorities being educated in their mother-tongue? If so, up until which level? (e.g. secondary school, high school, college, university etc.)

Immigration

- 1.7 Does your country have a specific immigration policy? If so, what are the main aims of the policy? What kind of criteria is used:
 Financial prerequisites (immigrants must have a certain amount of money before being allowed into the country) How much? _____
 Applicants must be either highly educated or specifically skilled (in which fields) or unskilled. Please provide details.
 Quotas of immigrants per year. How many? _____
 Applicants must have a sponsor (e.g. family member)
 Applicants must have already secured employment
 Priority list of immigrants coming from certain countries over immigrants from others. Which countries _____
 Political refugee status

- 1.8 Once immigrants arrive in your country are there settlement policies or programmes to
- place them in communities similar to their cultural background
 - try to avoid concentration of immigrants in one town or region
 - place them in special housing provided by the government or other non-governmental organisations (including refugee camps)
 - other, please indicate _____

Cultural infrastructure and media landscape

- 1.9 Please give some general background information on the cultural infrastructure and media landscape in your country by providing material on: (*more specific information to be presented in section # 5*)
- the market situation
 - export/import regulations,
 - role of global companies
 - indigenous production
 - media ownership patterns
 - strategies toward new media.
- 1.10 Official statistics which give an indication of the number of artists (authors, musicians, filmmakers, etc.) in your country.
- 1.11 Describe the role of professional arts and artists organisations in cultural policy making.
- 1.12 What level of access do citizens have to information technologies, e.g. the Internet? Is there a developed landscape for the artistic use of new technologies (e.g. via art and technology centres for artists)?

2. Cultural Policies and Human Rights

Information provided in this section should refer to general legal/legislative frameworks for culture and for human rights as well as provide an overview of governmental priorities in these fields during the past five years.

Cultural policy

- 2.1 Is there a formal national cultural policy framework in your country? If not, describe how culture and such policy related issues are considered in your country.*

A cultural policy framework is an all encompassing strategy or approach to cultural policy development. For example, in the Netherlands, the Dutch government prepares a four year plan which outlines a series of priorities or goals from which programmes are developed and funding is allocated. A framework is not a series of sector based policies, rather sector based policies fall under a clearly articulated or integrated strategic framework.

- 2.2 Please sum up the main cultural policy priorities of the government over the past five years.

Human rights legislation

- 2.3 What kinds of human rights legislation exist in your country? Is it included in the constitutional of your country or treated separately?
- 2.4 What kinds of mechanisms have been set up by the government to monitor and create programmes in support of human rights? For example: special tribunals or offices which can register human rights abuses or complaints. If not, are there plans to do so?*

- 2.5 Has there been any public discussion and/or court case decisions about your country's compliance with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in the past five years? Please describe (*articles of the UDHR include the right to participate in cultural life, the right to freedom of opinion and expression; principle of non-discrimination, economic, social and cultural rights*).

Cultural policy and human rights

- 2.6 Principles of human rights interpreted into domestic cultural policies:
- there are direct references to human rights in cultural policy
 - cultural policy and issues of human rights are still fairly separate issues in my country
- 2.7 Does media (broadcasting) legislation secure freedom of expression for, e.g. journalists and protection for their sources? Are there other specific measures or laws to promote freedom of expression and the right to communicate? Are there any provisions that may exempt governments from disseminating information (e.g. privacy or other protection laws)

3. Recognising Cultural and Artistic Diversity

The purpose of this section is to determine the public policies, levels of support and measures which recognise diverse forms of artistic and cultural expression. These will, of course, refer to many societal groups depending on political priorities. We have chosen 4 groups which represent different realities and levels of policy attention which should act as a guide to answering the questions below. These include:

- *women,*
- *ethnic minorities*
- *indigenous people and*
- *experimental or avant-garde artists, particularly in the field of new media.*

If there are special programmes for other social or cultural groups which are worth mentioning as examples, please include them.

- 3.1 Does cultural policy recognise different groups via specific measures or other programmes such as (*Please explain by referring to examples in the 4 groups identified in the box*). Describe these measures in the general essay.
- specific funding schemes
 - special awards
 - specialised institutions
 - production and dissemination aid for books and magazines, television or radio programmes in their mother-tongue
 - aid for artist-run or controlled production and distribution facilities;
 - community arts education programmes
 - support for art exhibitions or other cultural events
 - Other, please explain _____
- 3.2 Are there quota or incentive systems for such groups to participate in mainstream cultural policy decision-making processes? If so, please describe. (for example, quota regulations on the composition of grant giving bodies, award juries etc)

4. Cultural Education

- 4.1 Is citizenship education (or sometimes referred to as multicultural or cultural education) applied*
- on a broad level
 - only in specific schools
 - as a component of education policies and curricula
 - as an element of cultural policies and programmes
- 4.2 Are there educational strategies such as language training schemes which (please explain)
- give immigrants or ethnic minorities access to official language training to integrate them into the overall community
 - Actively promotes the language and culture of ethnic or linguistic minorities for everyday use (approach is to give the general population second language skills in the language of other major cultural groups)
- 4.3 Do ethnic or linguistic minorities have access to information/programmes in their mother-tongue in:
- Official government documentation
 - Daily or regular newspapers, books or magazines
 - Daily or regular radio/television productions
- 4.4 Does the government have an active youth exchange programme to promote dialogue. Please describe.
- among cultures from within your country
 - with cultures from other countries
 - both

5. Creativity, State Policies and Market Support

This section is explicitly designed to gather information about public measures which encourage the production of diverse cultural content. The culture industries mentioned here are defined as private sector businesses in the following fields: broadcasting, publishing/literature, film/tv/video, sound recording, performing arts, heritage, visual arts (including multimedia) Basic information on the general state of these industries should have been provided under section #1.

- 5.1 "Diversity-competition incentives". Are there **general programmes or strategic development plans** to promote diverse and/or domestic "content" production and distribution in the culture industries (or in the arts and media sector)? *
- 5.2 Are there any **specific measures** to foster diversity of cultural content via the development of the culture industries or support to artistic markets? *
- These could include film or literature funds; public grants or incentives to encourage domestic production and distribution to overcome market constraints via e.g. subsidies or guarantees for publications, exhibitions, concerts; sales guarantees to reduce the entrepreneurial risk of publishers, managers or galleries where no adequate market demand yet exists; state bodies which act as credit guarantors and distribute loans etc.*
- 5.3 Are there specific policy measures in place to sustain **SME's** (small to medium sized cultural industries), in particular?

- 5.4 Are there government regulations which specify the share of domestic to foreign cultural goods and services? *(Some public policy measures which promote or regulate diversity in the marketplace have included: fixed book prices, content quotas, foreign investment regulations, import restrictions, etc)*
- 5.4.1 In which fields are these regulations prevalent?
- 5.4.2 Describe the main objectives and policy goals for the introduction of quotas/incentives or similar measures *(such as safeguarding national identity or favouring indigenous content production)*
- 5.4.3 Are there alternative measures in addition to or beside quotas?
- 5.4.4 Has there been any public debate or discussion about these regulations in the past five years?
- 5.4.5 Which of the following statements would be more or less acceptable for those responsible for or active in the development of culture and media policies in your country? Explain further.

	Strongly Support	Accept	Reject
Media regulations can not really reduce the amount of foreign goods and services distributed in the country due to new communication technologies such as cable, satellite, Internet			
Indigenous productions need to be protected against foreign products because audiences want programmes and products in their own language and cultural traditions.			
Content quotas in the arts and media are against the general trends of globalisation, competition and free trade.			
Cultural goods and services, even if privately run, should not be confused with regular economic goods and services to be traded on the international market.			
Content regulations lead to bureaucracy and do not give media professionals the freedom to develop their own programming criteria.			
Since broadcasters are using audience ratings as their criteria for programme selection, they might as well also take government regulations into account.			
International programmes produced by large media groups foster stereotyped viewing and listening habits and in the long run affect cultural diversity and creativity.			